

**DISCLAIMER:**

*This is a copy of Evelyn Voigt's rough notes from the conference - transcribed into the computer during the 2007 Civilian Peace Service conference at Saint Paul University.  
EMPHATICALLY: These notes are neither complete, nor accurate. As such, they are definitively NOT for quotation. Please use them only for personal reference and to get a sense of the discussion that took place or the presentation made.*

***Peace as a Profession in the 21<sup>st</sup> Century***

**Conference Dates: April 3 to 5, 2007**

**Third in a Series of Workshops and Consultations**

**Saint Paul University, 223 Main Street, Ottawa, Ontario**

**Sponsored by: CPSC (Civilian Peace Service Canada)**

**(In Cooperation with CICR – Canadian Institute for Conflict Resolution; Conflict Studies Program, Saint Paul University; CIIAN – Canadian International Institute of Applied Negotiation; McMaster Centre for Peace Studies; TRANSCEND International Institute)**

**Wednesday, April 5, 2006**

**Panel Discussion VI:**

**9:15-10:15 pm**

**Moderator: Murray Thomson**

**Panel Members: Honourable Flora MacDonald , Mr. Dave Peabody, Dr. Graeme MacQueen**

**Implementing the Peace Professional Concept: Application to the Case of Afghanistan**

**Moderator, Murray Thomson:** Dave Peabody: Monitors civil-military cooperation... has a number of articles .... on ... in the Journal of strategic studies.

**First Panel Speaker: Mr. David Peabody:** Underlying assumptions:

1. I have been asked to explain Afghanistan in 10 minutes.
2. I do not have a military background, and have never been in Afghanistan.
3. I am also not defending or arguing for the Canadian mission in Afghanistan. I am only describing what the situation is and what the mission currently looks like.
4. I will reflect on where CPS would fit in.

(Insert his slide presentation)

The main purpose of the mission is to establish a presence... including central government ..set up and be seen... Also to engage hostile forces. Military civic activities: schools, roads, supplies deliveries. ...SAT advising Afghan government. Since they have

been there, there have been numerous engagements. 1) Medusa... Sept - Oct. .... Considered a success.... Taliban last year aimed to take over Kandahar city. ...Special forces pushed these people out of area, inflicted heavy damage, including on civilians. Although diverted Taliban, then kinetic... they went to pick a fight and they got one. The military realized they cannot keep blowing up civilians . This is not helping their mission. NATO recognized this too. Baz Tsuka... less kinetic.... Distinguished between Tier 1 and Tier 2 Taliban (Tier 1, hard core, could not negotiate with them; Tier 2, economic, fighting for pay check, could negotiate with them). Poverty is a factor so they could be won over. This operation less kinetic. Did not go looking for fight. Brought aid. Checkpoint. Initial reports look like they had much better results than in Operation Medusa. There, when our troops left, the Taliban moved right back in. This time, the Taliban has not yet moved back in. A lot of people ignore that the Taliban is a strategic force, with plans, so it is too early to tell if it really has been a success.

Where would CPS fit it? MOFA is there working with local govts and leaders....trying to get a handle: CIDA on development (medium and long term, and larger national programs) RCMP (training in law enforcement). USAID provides projects. There is a lot of conflict between CIDA and USAID about who is doing what properly. PRT is said to have had a slow start. Things seem to be getting into motion now. We cannot measure this in terms of months. This is a long term project.

CIMIC – military units interface with local pop, people, governments, NGO’s. Has projects, assessment. Not in implementing itself, but in identifying and contracting locals to do it, giving compensation for destroyed fields etc. Reports back: mixed success. And lessons learned. Becoming more influential within the battle groups bodies, hearts and minds.

CIMIC: challenges, inconsistencies. No unified methodology for CIMIC operation. Individual interpretations remain. Short and poor handovers between rotations. Once people there for 6 months and know how to buy bread at bakery, they are rotated and do or do not hand over, sometimes in 2 hours. Lessons learned are not being spread out.

**Civilian Peace Service:** would CPS work with SAT?

Become part of PRT (if we had a department of peace, probably yes)

Mandate? Bilateral? NGO’s? UN? How would CPS work with military? Would they?

Would they have to? They are a soft target. The Taliban target NGO’s... because they are easy to attack, and any attack has a big impact. So the NGO’s pull out ...

**Moderator Murray Thomson:**

If I had been a Minister in three departments, I would have thought the rest of my life would be over. Her life is just sort of beginning: Flora MacDonald... has been in Afghanistan on 9 different occasions, with a focus on Afghan women and their situation. I give you the Hon. Flora MacDonald.

**Second Panel Speaker, Flora MacDonald:** It was a great pleasure to hear Dr. Galtung, especially when he said: "Do, but make sure you can undo." Because so often I see

people going into countries -- going in with great intentions, but they don't always understand the impact of what they do. So they may not always be right. I'm not sure I'm the right person to be speaking to this: the peace professional concept. I'm not a peace professional, or a Quaker! This does not mean I can't be involved. Afghanistan could certainly benefit from peace professionals. I speak to women and how they continually do the work of encouraging peace. I first went back in Feb 2001. In 1988, I couldn't get in. The Taliban was still in power in 2001 and it was a very different atmosphere to get into. The way you were curtailed in getting around was a shock to me; or to make sure I was completely covered up before I went out into the street. I seldom ran across any other women on the street.

Later that year, things had changed considerably. In Kabul, they were primarily dressed in the burka. Westerners make a lot out of a burka. They have been wearing it for 500 years. Who am I or any one else to say how they should dress? We do not understand the complexity of that country; the history of that country. Canadians are being given a most unbalanced view on Afghanistan. The focus is heavily on Kandahar, with our troops there. I don't argue about that. I have visited with the military; made it a point of interacting with them. I have invited General ??..... to come and have dinner with me and Afghan people so he could see what they are all about. But I think it is so important for us to realize that Kandahar is only One of 40 provinces of Afghanistan. What is happening in the other 39? How are people reacting? What is their mood?

The first I learned is the variety of cultures. I come at this from a background of having heard of Afghanistan from my childhood. My grandfather was stationed in the Khyber. He was with the Black Watch. (He would only go with a Scottish not an English regiment!) The fact is that what is happening in the rest of Afghanistan really intrigues me. You have to be a student of the history of this great country which goes back for 1000s of years.

When Alexander the Great used it as through-way to India, he was not the first. There have been many migrations since. Afghans are very well aware of their history. Their oral traditions have passed information from generation to generation. Young people can tell you about battles that happened hundreds of years ago.

It is a very conservative society. Very heavily male dominated. It is said to have a population of 30m people -- almost the size of Canada -- but without any background data to back it up. This is an estimate. They have had no census for years. It is a country that has been in continuous conflict from 1979, with various invasions: the USSR, civil war, mujehadin fighting several tribes. During that time 2m people killed, most of them men. The number of widows is in the hundreds of thousands, with many hundreds of thousands more children.

This effort to get involved with that group took me to Afghanistan. CARE Canada, CARE International, has been working there since 1964, without ever having left. While I appreciate what the military in Kandahar is doing, development is not something you can do on a 6-month rotating basis....

When I first went to Afghanistan, it was to interact with some of these widows. Every month they would come to four stations in Kabul, where they were given a bag of wheat flour, lentils, oil and sugar. They had to have four children under the ages of 16 to qualify. When they came, they were lined up in strict lines. They were not allowed to talk to one another. There were strict rules. No men were allowed there, which is why I was allowed in. That was while the Taliban was in control. Later that year, things were entirely different.

I went to see that project each year. The women themselves are putting different programs into place. For example, one year they were sewing uniforms for girls going back to school. (Girls were not allowed to go to school for years, and women were not allowed to teach. The next year, women were being taught to plant kitchen gardens and given seeds. They had to find their own land around Kabul so they could grow vegetables. Next year, some of the women were called in and given three weeks' training in how to raise chickens. Then they received 30 chickens and a rooster and wire and sticks to build chicken coops, so they could get eggs. One woman showed me the eggs they collected that day. "I fed 125 to my children this month and sold the other 300 in the market to buy shoes for my children.", she said. At the same time, these little girls that I first saw when I was there when Taliban was in power who were not allowed to go to school, were brought into underground schools. We were running underground schools. In one area, where there was a large house, we asked for one room for little girls to be taught. The little girls would come in quietly in the day. The children were so anxious to learn! Drinking up that kind of information that they were being taught! Some Taliban soldiers came out to say: "We know what you're doing. If you take our daughters in, we won't say a word." The next year (following the Taliban) girls were in school. Girls between the ages of 9 and 15 years did not want to go into school with really young beginners. So we devised a special plan where you would take the older girls give them grades 1-3 condensed in one year, and then they go into grade four, with girls more their own size. Now there are four million girls in school. Unfortunately, where there is fighting going on, for example in the South, schools have been destroyed and 2000 girls are no longer able to attend.

### **The role of religion and its impact:**

Where I travelled, is into the countryside. There are four major cities, in the four corners of the country. Seventy five per cent of the population lives outside those cities and is, by and large, not getting the attention of government resources. Yes, there are new schools, clinics and roads that connect those four cities. But in the countryside, outside of those four cities, the President of Afghanistan is referred to as the mayor of Kabul. It is important that much more be done in the country side. I go out to the provinces of Gahzni ?? and Banya??... where the majority of people are hasaric??, Shia people. They are the main Shia population in that country. They are the majority in their own little area, but the minority in a Shia country and persecuted by every other community. So they know what it is to try and strengthen and protect themselves against all the others trying to attack them. Shoygun?? Valley is where I go.

Many of the young men who have been kidnapped by the war lords and brought into the militia as their soldiers, and are then demobilized and sent back to their villages, said to us: "We want an education. We know nothing but how to use a gun." We said, "You build the school. We will get teachers." They figured out how to do it, and told us: "We are going to form a political party. We have a name, a slogan, and work for it. It is the Pago (?) party... Pago (?) means crazy. The slogan is, 'If you're crazy enough to think the future will be better, you join the Pago party.' Each one of us members has to go away and make 2000 bricks."

That's what they did. They built themselves a two-room school: one room for the boys and one for the girls. It would not win an architectural prize, but it serves its purpose. Enlarged and enlarged, it has since become a community centre. They were elected within the village, without any interference from militia or NGO's. They elected their own shura ?? (local council). More and more villages copied it. 72 have now followed suite. They now have a shura?? (local councils) that represents the whole valley.

A friend stationed with the UN in Afghanistan came to see it. They said they had never seen anything like it. The people of the valley had taken two decisions: 1) that there should be no guns; and 2) that there would be no poppies cultivated in the valley. Wherever the growing of poppies was contravened, the local council went out and themselves pulled out the poppy plants, and then found who had planted them. What bothered them next was that Banja?? town hadn't got its act together to show the work done by the local councils. This year on international women's day, I got an e-mail from a Canadian Afghan saying, "I want you to know we finally have elected a shura ?? in Banja?? town. It has 12 members, including 4 women. For the first time in the history of Afghanistan a woman has been elected to lead it. She is a great woman. She has established her own business. She is the proper person to lead us. Now all the other shurras?? in the valley are beginning to say: "We want to know how that happened". This will have an impact. It was not done by dictate. It was done by people saying it must be done; by these resilient people themselves. They have been survivors of so many various impositions and yet they continue to struggle and show others their own creativity. Galtung's emphasised promoting creativity. Afghanistan is a good example of what can happen.

**Third Panel Speaker: Graeme MacQueen:  
(Insert his paper, the notes below are full of gaps)**

I will explore the realities of CPS in Afghanistan. I am a member of the .... working group on Afghanistan for .... I speak on my own behalf, because two of our group live in Afghanistan, and words may have impact on them.

Western peace orgs have operated since 1815 with a range of relations to government, from close collaboration to utter opposition ... a rich but risky zone of cooperation with government. The Afghanistan case is important ... I see risks and possible potential... need guidelines... for Canadian peace professions as proposed by CPS.

**My convictions:**

- CPS can never be a simple agent of government ... ties and accountability of NGOs. Even if (when) we are successful in getting a Department of Peace, and I strongly support this effort, I still do not agree that a CPS agency be wholly dependent on the Government.
- CPS must look at the big picture and be committed to a long term vision. There are two main systems for dealing with conflicts: A war system – based on an integrated military ...; or we need to construct and deploy a peace system, legal and cultural, without or minimal resort to force. The UN was formed in part to deal with this.... Committed to second...
- Need a set of clear guidelines... at a minimum the following:
  - CPS will not use force. It may, at times, complement police operations, but it will not assist in war making;
  - CPS will not violate international law;
  - CPS will not assist a party to win;
  - CPS will not serve the interest of the Canadian government or population at the expense of another;
  - CPS will not violate the human rights of populations; or
  - attack religions

The problematic for CPS is to be deployed where the Canadian Government is fighting a war.

**Afghanistan:** Apart from the Peace Initiative of CIDA there has been no encouragement for peace making. I am not making complaint, but I want to draw attention to what we were told by CIDA and DFAIT from 94-99: “Afghanistan is simply not very high on the Canadian priority list.” This changed in 2000. It is now the largest recipient of Canadian aid. We are often told it was 2001 that changed everything -- not the events, but particularly the interpretation and response. Neither was inevitable. Both were promoted by Bush. Both ultimately were accepted by the Canadian Government. Bush, the day after 9-11, defined the events as acts of war, not as terrorism. NATO accepted this and ...

Most centres, including McMaster, defined the events as crimes, and wanted them dealt with by international courts. The US, India and Israel excepted, all 34 others favoured extradition and treatment of the perpetrators as criminals. Even in the US, there was powerful support for the use of international law. In 2002, 83% of Americans wanted them tried in international court. Bush was interested in isolating and weakening the ICC. There were several proposals to have Bin Laden extradited to Pakistan and the... international tribunal to decide where he should be tried...

In my view, this was a war of aggression, based on... claim .. not on basis of... international law. The Security council never sought or retained.... None offered invasion of Afghanistan.... And the invasion is illegal... Postwar afghan, invasion unwise and illegal therefore not go to MOFA meeting on reconstruction of Afghanistan.

There has been a major attempt to rehabilitate the war as a system, undermined international legal system, and growing ... of peace.

I worry about an invasion of Iran. On Feb 28, 2007, Chris Alexander, ex ambassador, and NATO.... Both of these men presented the essence of the mission in Afghanistan as being to combat terrorism. "They take their orders from Bin Laden and if we don't stop them in Afghanistan they will come for us here." One must make a distinction between hard core terrorists and those who are just fighting. The former one must not talk to ...must assassinate their leaders.... Canadians directed against terrorism giving afghans what they want.... Concluded that this best exemplifies Canadian peace keeping mission!

I do not feel that a CPS mission could cooperate with the Government of Canada in Afghanistan. Can we get beyond the flawed beginnings in war? Don't the good things count? I believe we can redeem ourselves, but only in the context of a comprehensive peace process, dialogue with the Taliban – this is not the same as negotiations. The proposal is numerous, multiple dialogues, including el kaida et al, and many disaffected groups, in which one does not try to bring them together with NATO at all. Find out what they want.... Without this attempt our current mission is wrong and it will fail. We have no business finding and destroy in someone else's country. Given that NATO will abandon Afghanistan as they have done so many times..... why are we surprised at bitterness to west, to the US. Afghans told us: "We were used like toilet paper; used and then thrown away. When I wanted a surface to air missile to use against USSR, I got it instantly. Now I cannot get a pencil for my child."

Our policy and military mission was changed. I think it should become a peace mission. Not necessarily get our troops out now, if they can change it into a peace mission.

**What is the role of CPS in Afghanistan?** If in current situation, it can do it in a way which distances itself from govt. etc. .... multi-track peace work. **Multi track or sectoral peace work.** Where you have expertise. Good at that. Also trained as peace professional. Plus third training... how to use this sector of the ... to help with peace. Multi-track peace work should be central to CPS peace work ... work as consultants to help shape that sector in Afghanistan, to strengthen peace.

**If it is to help the current Government of Canada mission, then I am not convinced CPS should be there. Then CPS should work in Canada to change the Canadian mission.** Suppose Canadian military are taking part in civil war, in extraordinarily complex...

**What if they were peace mission, asked by locals, this is the plan some have been proposing (3<sup>rd</sup> option). In this context, 3 roles for CPS:**

- **Multi-track peace consultation...** part of what our organization has been doing in the educational sector: workshops, peace education being incorporated into the formal, national curriculum, story books for children. Help children and parents understand effects of trauma. Happy but far more meaningful if there were a peace process at national level. CPS with expertise in other sector,

- In addition to multi track, **peace brigade, witnessing, election monitoring, CPS distinctive uniforms**, but more than taking orders, helping to frame these tasks.
- There is a need for a great deal of listening, both formal (for research) and informal to all Afghans, to let them express their grievances and sorrows which become information for how to help them build their own peace making capacity.

I could conclude that we need peace professionals, a CPS, in Afghanistan; but not until the Government of Canada changes its policy and mission to dialogue among parties to the conflict.... With a dual training and multi-track peace service... using a clear set of guidelines....

### **QUESTIONS:**

**Question to Mr. Peabody:** Your reaction as to how the proposals that Dr. MacQueen has made could possibly be received by the Canadian forces, and how you would integrate what the Hon Flora MacDonald has been saying with your research?

**Mr. Dave Peabody:** My understanding is that the Canadian forces are sold on the mission. Enlisted folks are not allowed to speak out against the mission in any big way. My experience... I have not heard anybody from forces saying this is wrong. They take the mandate they have been given, and say “how can we make this work”, as best they can. Whether the mission is going to work, I cannot answer that. If it did change, how would it affect our work? My talk is not aimed at analyzing conflict, only on reporting what happened and letting people make their own decisions. For me, I just have good information.

### **QUESTION:**

We think CIMIC ?? not unified.... What is your understanding of how mission and civil needs are understood?

### **ANSWER:**

**Mr. Dave Peabody:** CIMIC ?? is gaining influence in the forces. One thing is that cold war fighters are retiring and new officers now have experience on ground, and therefore have a better understanding of civil military importance: different people; different understanding of how to relate. There is no one over-riding rule and doctrine. We are used to having different attitudes. Soldiers have different ideas. I do think a lot of them are trying to find a way to work to de-conflict (not cooperate!)... more: how can we not be in each other's work?

### **QUESTION:**

Women for Peace, Diane McIntyre: The culture of war is winning over the culture of peace. Dr. MacQueen and Ms. MacDonald: What can we do to reinforce that we need the ICC involved when there have been criminals of war? The UN... doesn't seem to help. ICC doesn't seem to apply. What we, with hope in our hearts (the 83-85 % us who

felt should be taken to court) can do? We sit helplessly watching the landslide into the next election, with no agenda ?? except reinforce culture of war.

**Hon. Flora MacDonald** – A number of those perpetrators hold position in the current Afghan government. So we know where to start. It is important to make an effort to change the way in which the media reports on Afghanistan. Canadians know what is going there because of what they hear on the media. I have said to newspaper reporters, “Come with me. And see what they are doing to overcome their own problems.” They say: “No Flora. It’s not safe.” Sure, it’s not safe. In the main streets of Ottawa I could get run over by a car. But unless you try, you won’t get anywhere. I try to get the Canadian media better informed about what is really happening and not only in covering the military aspects. That would be a great breakthrough.

**Dr. Graeme MacQueen** – On the use of the International Criminal Court: We need to be persistent. A lot of people don’t get that ICC is not there to assist war...it is to replace it. In relation to the Iraq war... we made a point of referring it to their illegal invasion... explained it according to the UN charter... and why it matters a lot to human future. War crimes were referred to as “supreme international crime”, because all other crimes are contained within them. For example, lawyers against war... made Rumsfeld uncomfortable when German court cited him... because of his action, .... We have to start to make everybody accountable...even if people laugh and say, Ha. Ha. Does that mean we take Bush to court? Ha. Ha.

#### **QUESTION:**

Flora MacDonald spoke of the women in the group, and men. What I find, in having had discussions in the Sudan and Columbia... is how do we begin to deal with the military/militant mothers who are raising martyrs for war. They are an incredibly strong force for war... How do we even begin to have discussions with mothers for martyrs.

**Hon. Flora MacDonald:** ...doing things which better inform the Canadian public, will have an influence on your second point. I hear a lot from the Canadian military. I was the first woman to ever have been on the National Defence College Training for a year on how conflicts work around the world. I often asked to talk to women, in various categories, on what women can bring to their particular disciplines. Whether Somalia or Rwanda, nothing gets done until you learn how to work with the individuals in that country and learn what their problems are... There is an overlay of fear, but beyond that they are still trying to raise their children, provide health and educational services and here you can cut across all sorts of other barriers to get to what the conflict is all about.

#### **QUESTION**

**Carl Stieren, journalist,** Galtung says there has to be a space for a coalition government to form in Afghanistan. If we can’t, how can we work as peace makers workers in Afghanistan? Flora MacDonald was to show two methods. Peabody suggests that we do development under military control. We, as Friends/Quakers would have to go to the Taliban as well, so as not to be dealing with only one party to the conflict. What were the words of the song: “There is a crack. There is a crack in everything. That’s where the

light gets in. I am seeing in .... where Care got into Afghanistan as the crack that gave the people more power etc. and whether that might be a more fruitful solution that working under the army?

**QUESTION** - Thank you for your stories, and your education etc. and Graeme for analysis in an area that has been completely ignored. How to be proactive? How to prevent problems from becoming conflagration? **Question:** To the first speaker: Operation Medusa, and the second operation was more successful. Is the military learning that a different kind of way of working could be more effective? The public is certainly not learning that there was a second kind of intervention. They see only the War of terror. My background is in peace studies... One cannot understand peace, without understanding war. If you want to go there now, you have to ask serious questions about neutrality ... and can you be neutral?

**Mr. Dave Peabody:** Development in Afghanistan is part of the Afghan compact, a guiding principle of stabilizing this country. I don't want to say you can't, but I cannot ... CARE takes money from CIDA ..... how can CARE remain neutral? I don't know. I think the village sounds a lot like solidarity ...

**Hon. Flora MacDonald:** No! It's entirely different...

**Mr. Dave Peabody** ...the official story is that that locals are supposed to elect their own councils etc.

**Hon. Flora MacDonald :** the main group that I work with is a group called Future Generations, to ensure that there are future generations. Basic to it is the village council, those who can get the work done. The people whom I recruit to go with me, are people who came from Afghanistan and who are making a success of their business here; and I say to them, "Don't you feel some need to share your success?" They are protégés that I attract and leave them there.... But the things they do:

- 1) work with local people to set up their own ongoing local governance. NSP ?? is for a short period of time. Future generations are not funded by GOC. They also work with ensuring that they are getting support from the Dept of Education, or Rural Rehabilitation of the Afghan Government, and then make sure that there are some people like Canadian Afghans who go with me, and outside experts who advise... that is, seed-scale... we start small, then go to scale ... we bring people in and allow them to work over a period of time. It is done with the joint action of the people in the community and the people supposedly in charge and outside experts. And so that's how we put it all together. In Tibet, Peru, Northern India, Afghanistan, we work where there are high mountains because that is where fewer organizations go to work, and yet that is where there are some of the most vulnerable people. But we make sure we understand what the people involved want...

**QUESTIONS:**

- Lester B. Pearson said “We prepare for war like precocious giants, and for peace like retarded pigmies.” Comments. Who are the Taliban today? Who are the Canadian forces fighting? In 2000, there were only 2000 Taliban... mainly students... the US/NATO forces have killed 4-5,000; yet the Taliban are still appearing. My understanding is that the presence of the invaders are creating the Taliban.
- Joseph Kieran: I commend the Hon. Flora MacDonald. I'm from Burundi... bringing together local stakeholders, leaders, etc. Please coach me in doing the same thing for Burundi. And anybody who is interested in working on Burundi I would invite you to get in touch with me. There is so much to do: academic, mediation, business, development, local government, gender issues.... If you are intimidated that it is a Francophone country, Burundi just joined the EAC, so it will need to learn English. My phone is (613) 695 2500, my e-mail is: [josephkira@yahoo.com](mailto:josephkira@yahoo.com).
- After 500 years of colonialism, we as white people would do better is to surrender...
- Ja devitch .. Originally from Bosnia. I know what it means to live in conflict. I want peace for everybody, especially for Afghani who through history have suffered many – British, American, etc. invasions. The three D's: defence, development, diplomacy.... We are only working on one. And we have turned it into offence. I work as an advocate for Afghanistan. There are two key issues: the national issue is Afghanistan. The international issue is Afghanistan. Why don't we network better and go to Parliament and send this message to Canadians. And go to TV . If you open the paper of yesterday .... Stop chasing Taliban.

## ANSWERS

**Mr. Dave Peabody:** who are Taliban? Good question! A word that is overused. It used to mean foreign fighters... those against 'us' – In Somalia, drug dealers, tribal groups. ... people who are angry we drove our tanks through their crops but did not compensate them for it; or angry that other agencies have destroyed their opium crops. It's a misnomer. As for the last question, I don't know. Is there military learning? Who knows? I've never been in combat. If someone shoots at me, would I save thirty men under my command? There are so many different versions of events. No idea, where it is going; what will happen.

**Dr. Graeme MacQueen:** Who are the Taliban? good question! Their origins? They have been so thoroughly demonized in Canada. They are not worse than the Mujahadeen. They were more heavily funded by the CIA than any organism ever, with Pakistan. In Kandahar, the Taliban were the groups that came in and offered people security. They were Islamic students, refugees, etc. I do not want to overstate ... but they actually were

welcomed into Kandahar. They did disarm a variety of groups. They did increase security. They did advise women to go home. But the rape was reduced. They decided to take over the whole country and became more repressive than others. They also destroyed the opium crops. At that point, the West should have sent in help to change the economy. All we said was, "who cares". That's what our group was going to do. So I just want to say that these people are not from outer space fanatics, and some of them wish to be part of the dialogue. Some of them mentioned that we did not talk about underlying causes, material conditions. We are soon going to be in crisis in world oil production... 90% of the oil is under Muslim control. The US is by far the largest user of oil, and they are trying to secure the oil. They are taking us for dupes. We should not allow ourselves to be duped.

**Hon. Flora MacDonald:** The Taliban are very amorphous and very hard to describe at any given time. Yes, it began as Ian said, not only in Kabul but beyond, where they were highly welcomed. Then militant folks took control and began to lose the good will the Taliban had built up. President Khazai said when he was here in Canada that a military solution was not going to be possible at all. Other things need to be done. As long as the bulk of the population's needs are left unaddressed -- that great group out there beyond the four cities who are not being listened to and think they are being ignored and feel they have no kind of reception by their government -- it is a source of concern by people that I hear from. Unless we get something done for us, they say, then we are natural recruits for the Taliban, because they will pay us; they will help us; they are doing things that the government is not doing. And, therefore, we must have a long term, call it a Department of Peace, but emphasize the need for equitable development for the whole country of Afghanistan, and don't give them nowhere else to go but to the Taliban, whom we are trying to control. And, yes, we (the Afghan CPS conference panel) will go on television!